

Task: Based on the case study below, as a group, take a stance on whether Judy's illness was mishandled (or not) by whom and provide at least 2 reasons to support your stance.

Choose from the following responses to start your argument and then elaborate using reasons from the case study and the reading:

- A. Judy's illness was not mishandled. Her parents did what was best. [Insert reasons.]
- B. Judy's illness was not mishandled. The healthcare providers did what was best. [Insert reasons.]
- C. Judy's illness was mishandled by her parents. [Insert reasons.]
- D. Judy's illness was mishandled by the healthcare providers. [Insert reasons.]

Considerations as you read: Pay particular attention to the multiple cultural and religious factors that influence Judy's (a child) medical management. Additionally, consider these questions to help write your argument.

- Think about the theories of health and illness (Personalistic, Naturalistic, Biomedical).
 - Which one(s) do the Cohen's likely believe?
 - Which one(s) do the healthcare providers likely believe?
- Think about worldview (e.g., individualism vs. collectivism; fate vs. free will).
 - How does the Cohen's worldview impact the way they approach Judy's treatment?
 - How does the healthcare providers' worldview impact the way they approach Judy's treatment?

Case study: Judy Cohen is age 6. Her family practices Hasidic Judaism, a religious movement founded in the 18th century in eastern Europe that maintains God's presence is in all of one's surroundings and that one should serve God in every deed and word. Much of her life revolves around the neighborhood synagogue, her extended family, and their Hasidic Jewish community. The Cohen house is awash in the smells of Mrs. Cohen's cooking, the sounds of Yiddish prayer and conversation, and the laughter of children. The Cohens speak English, but they prefer to speak their native language. Judy's mother stays home to care for Judy and her four siblings, ages 3, 7, 9, and 10 years. Judy's father, Mr. Cohen, works for a family business. When he is not working, he is usually praying, socializing, and consulting with the rabbi at the synagogue.

When she was 12 months old, Judy was diagnosed with cystic fibrosis (CF), which is an inherited chronic disease that affects the lungs and digestive system. At the time, the medical team that specialized in CF recommended that her siblings have sweat tests, which is the test used for diagnosing cystic fibrosis. Judy's parents declined because they believed that their children's health was in God's hands. Judy's condition was stable then, and she and her mother attended regularly scheduled appointments with the CF team. Judy's father, although he was concerned, did not usually come to Judy's appointments.

When Judy was 18 months old, she went to the clinic with an increased cough and weight loss. The team recommended that she be hospitalized. Judy's parents initially declined but agreed a week later after her cough had worsened.

At age 4, Judy again went into the hospital for pneumonia. Mr. and Mrs. Cohen reluctantly agreed to the hospital admission. When Judy appeared to be responding to the intravenous antibiotics, her parents convinced the medical team to allow Judy to complete her regimen of antibiotics at home. When she was home, the family did have their daughter complete the course of antibiotics that was recommended, but they refused visiting nurse services because they did not want the neighbors to know about Judy's illness.

When Mrs. Cohen became pregnant with her fifth child, the medical team strongly suggested that she go for genetic counseling and testing. After discussing the issue with their rabbi, Mr. and Mrs. Cohen decided not to have genetic testing. Again, they believed that "whatever will be, will be" and that the unborn child's health was in God's hands.

Today, Judy went to the clinic for a routine follow-up appointment. This is her first visit since beginning school. Her respiratory status is good, but she is having more frequent stools. After being questioned, Mr. and Mrs. Cohen admit that they do not want the school to give Judy the required enzymes, which are recommended so that she can digest her food. They have not told anyone at the school that Judy has CF.